## The Right Logic? Handout

# I. Branching quantifiers

1. Some relative of each villager and some relative of each townsman hate each other.

2. 
$$(x)\{Vx \supset (\exists y)\{Ryx \bullet (z)[Tz \supset (\exists w)(Rwz \bullet Hyw \bullet Hwy)]\}\}$$

3. (x){Tx 
$$\supset$$
 ( $\exists$ y){Ryx • (z)[Vz  $\supset$  ( $\exists$ w)(Rwz • Hyw • Hwy)]}}

4. 
$$(x)(\exists y)(z)(\exists w)[(Vx \supset Ryx) \bullet (Tz \supset Rwz) \bullet Hyw \bullet Hwy]$$

5. 
$$(x)(\exists y)$$
:  
:  $[(Vx \supset Ryx) \bullet (Tz \supset Rwz) \bullet Hyw \bullet Hwy]$   
 $(z)(\exists w)$ :

6. Some book by every author is referred to in some essay by every critic.

## II. Virtues of first-order logic

- 1. Completeness
- 2. A variety of definitions of logical truth concur: in terms of logical structure, substitution of sentences or of terms, satisfaction by models, and proof.
- 3. Every consistent first-order theory has a model.
- 4. Compactness
- 5. Upward and downward Löwenheim-Skolem features

All of these properties fail in second-order logic; see Mendelson, *Introduction to Mathematical Logic*, p 377.

#### III. Change of logic - change of subject

Chair<sub>1</sub>: desk chairs, dining room chairs, and such, but not recliners or bean bag chairs Chair<sub>2</sub>: all chair<sub>1</sub> objects, and also recliners and bean bag chairs

#### IV. The existence of God

$$\begin{vmatrix} 1. & \neg(\exists x)x = g \\ 2. & (x)x = x \end{vmatrix}$$
 Assumption, for indirect proof Principle of identity 
$$\begin{vmatrix} 3. & (x) \neg x = g \\ 4. & g = g \end{vmatrix}$$
 1, Change of quantifier rule 
$$\begin{vmatrix} 4. & g = g \\ 5. & \neg g = g \end{vmatrix}$$
 2, UI 
$$\begin{vmatrix} 5. & \neg g = g \\ 6. & g = g \bullet \neg g = g \end{vmatrix}$$
 3, UI 
$$\begin{vmatrix} 6. & g = g \bullet \neg g = g \\ 6. & (\exists x) & x = g \end{vmatrix}$$
 4, 5, Conj 
$$\begin{vmatrix} 1-5, & \text{Indirect proof} \end{vmatrix}$$
 1-5, Indirect proof