

The Two Dogmas Of Empiricism

Osaruese Odeh

Two Dogmas

- ▶ The first belief is there is exist a fundamental distinction between truths that are analytic, grounded in meanings independently of matters of fact, and truths that are synthetic, or grounded in fact.
 - ▶ Examples
 - ▶ “Radiologists are doctors”
 - ▶ “Radiologists are rich”
- ▶ Reductionism
 - ▶ The belief that each meaningful statement can be reduced to some logical construct in regards to terms which refer to immediate experience.

Quine Views

- ▶ Quine proposes three arguments against the logical empiricist
 - ▶ There is no synthetic/analytic distinction
 - ▶ There is no reductionism
 - ▶ These two presuppositions are one and the same. There is no distinction

Logical Empiricists

- ▶ In the attempts to create a connection between our sense data and science
- ▶ centered on understanding meaning, in the attempts to further develop Hume's claim that matters of fact trace back to initial sense experience
- ▶ This they referred to as the Verification theory of meaning
 - ▶ A sentence is meaningful if it is verifiable on the basis of observation
 - ▶ Any unverifiable sentence is meaningless
- ▶ The problem that arose was determining how sentences should be verified

Analytic and Synthetic Distinctions

- ▶ Ayer proposes two arguments
 - ▶ A statement has meaning if and only if the proposition it expresses is either analytic or empirically verifiable”
 - ▶ A statement is verifiable if some possible sense-experience would be relevant to the determination of its truth or falsehood
- ▶ Synthetic Distinction (Observation & Science)
 - ▶ Empirical
 - ▶ Methods of verification
- ▶ Analytic Distinction (Math & Logic)
 - ▶ Probability
 - ▶ Logic
 - ▶ Nonsense

Analytic Characterization (A1-A5)

- ▶ Analytic statements are true in all possible worlds
- ▶ Analytic true statements cannot be false, conversely, analytic false statements cannot be true
- ▶ The denial of an analytic statement is a self-contradiction
- ▶ The analytic statement is one in which the concept of the predicate is contained in the concept of the subject
- ▶ Analytic statements are true in virtue of meaning

Synonymy

- ▶ The argument presented against the analytic/synthetic distinction
- ▶ Quine presents three characterizations of synonymy
 - ▶ Logic
 - ▶ Dictionary definitions
 - ▶ Interchangeability

Logic (Meaning postulates)

- ▶ Carnap presents meaning postulates as a means of characterizing synonymy
 - ▶ The use of axiom to show that two statements are synonymous of one another within any theory
- ▶ Theories are best understood through state-descriptions
 - ▶ They associate truth values to atomic sentences of theory
- ▶ Following the semantic rules we are able to construct complex sentences, ensuring that all substitutions of synonymous expressions will maintain analyticity
 - ▶ Carnap's analytic sentences

Logic (Meaning Postulates) Cont..

- ▶ Quine argues that the problem with this characterization is that fail to explain analyticity
- ▶ Carnap ways produces many semantic rules for synonymy, it may provide a definition but it fails to show us how to apply it
- ▶ Quine criticism of Carnap is we fail to truly characterize analyticity, but express its essence
- ▶ Stating analytic statements are true by definition presupposes synonymy rather than explains it

Explication & Interchangeability

- ▶ Quine argues that characterization of synonymy as substitutive is faulty
- ▶ Linguistics imposes restrictions on synonymy
- ▶ He argues that we can only assume substitution in regards to term for term, the problem arises when we attempt to substitute term for words.
 - ▶ Bachelor and bachelor of arts
- ▶ Quine argues that due to its inconsistency we are faced with claims which tells are unable to express analyticity but presuppose it

Characterization

- ▶ Quine argues against these characterizations, stating that analyticity could not exist independent of logical truth
- ▶ Synonymy must also be explicated wither by definition or in terms of interchangeability
- ▶ Since these characterizations fail then there can be no analytic/synthetic distinction