Kripkenstein:
A reexamination of Private Language

By Brendon and TC

Kripke's look on Private Language

- Common View + Hal and Nick- PLA starts with 243

- Kripke- No, PLA starts much before that

- This presentation- What is Kripke's look on the PLA, specifically in these early sections?

Wittgenstein #185

- Pupil creates series 0,2,4,6,8....

- Teacher tells pupil "continue the series beyond 1000"

- Pupil writes 1000,1004,1008,1012...

Teacher- "What are you doing? You're supposed to add 2"

Pupil- "I thought I was meant to do it like this"

"Add 2 up to 1000, 4 up to 2000, 6 up to 3000...."

Main Point

- "In #201 Wittgenstein says, "this was our paradox: no course of action could be determined by a rule, because every course of action can be made to accord with the rule." (627)

Plus and Quus

- Math problem for Steve: 68+57=125?

- Skeptic-"How do you know how to compute 'plus'?"
- Steve-"'+' means addition which I have done many times before"
- Skeptic-"But how do you know what you have done before? Maybe, in the past, by 'plus' you meant 'quus'!

Quus

- X ⊕ Y= x+y if x,y<57, =5 otherwise

- Does not actually matter how you define Quus, actually arbitrary function

Skeptic's Argument

- You cannot know what you meant in the past by "plus"

- Infinite possibilities from given point in series

Aspects of Rules

- Rules are not absolute

- Rules are community-made constructions

- However, you CAN establish rules

Private Language Argument

- Language is inherently part of a community

- Private model problem, impossible to look at language by itself

Private Model

- "What is really denied is what might be called the 'private model' of rule following, that the notion of a person following a given rule is to be analyzed simply in terms of facts about the rule follower and the rule follower alone, without reference to his membership in a wider community." (635)

Group Activity!

- "Does this mean that Robinson Crusoe, isolated on an island, cannot be said to follow any rules, no matter what he does?" (Kripke 635)

Kripke *on Robinson Crusoe*

- "Does this mean that Robinson Crusoe, isolated on an island, cannot be said to follow any rules, no matter what he does?" (Kripke 635)

- Physical isolation, but we are considering him as a part of our community

- Regardless of geographic isolation, what matters is if we are truly *considering* him in isolation.

Impossibility of Private Causation

- Hume (633)
- a is believed to cause b
- Causation cannot be established in isolation
- Events of type A are always followed by events of type B
- Then a can be said to cause b

- Impossibility of private language is that no language can have meaning if considered in isolation