

## Against Qualia

**Qualia so far:** Qualia has posed a problem for many positions we have studied thus far. For instance, physicalists have been criticized for leaving qualia out of their picture (recall Mary in the black and white room). Similarly, the Functionalists fail to account for qualia (recall the Homonculi-headed robot).

**Dennett's Objective:** In "Quining Qualia," Dennett wants to refute the existence of qualia, thus leading us into Eliminativism and the denial of mental states all together.

**Dennett's Argument:** Dennett begins his argument by giving a definition of qualia. This definition attributes four main properties to qualia. Dennett then uses "intuition pumps" to show that no such thing with those four properties exists, and thus qualia do not exist.

### Dennett's Account of Qualia:

- Ineffable
- Intrinsic
- Private
- Directly or Immediately Apprehensible

### Against Ineffability:

- Intuition Pump #14: The Jello Box
- Instead of just indicating the matching torn edge of the box, our language could develop such that we could explain the phenomenal information properties of one torn edge by itself, and in essence we could "eff the ineffable."

### Against Intrinsicity:

- Intuition Pump #9: The experienced beer drinker
- Tastes can change or be acquired, and so our experience of taste is relational (depends on outside factors). There is nothing intrinsic (inherent regardless of outside factors) about the quale.

### Against Privacy:

- Intuition Pump #4: The Brain-storm machine
- First-person assessments of qualia are not very reliable due to potential lapses in memory.

### Against being Directly Apprehensible:

- Intuition Pump #11: The guitar string (and wine tasting)
- We can be trained to hear subtle differences in the harmony of the guitar string, and so the auditory quale is not directly or immediately apprehended.

**Conclusion:** Qualia are things that are ineffable, intrinsic, private, and directly or immediately apprehensible. Since there does not exist anything with the properties of ineffability, intrinsicity, privacy, or direct apprehension in consciousness, qualia do not exist.

### Questions to Consider:

- Is it possible to develop intuition pumps that would satisfy each property of qualia? Consider Fred and the tomatoes.
- Should we allow Dennett's presumption that qualia need to fit into a purely physical explanatory picture of our internal and external processes?

